



International Labour Organization

**IPEC** International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour

# **IPEC** *Evaluation*

---

**Programme to Prevent and Progressively  
Eliminate Child Labour in Small-Scale  
Traditional Mining in South America  
RLA/02/50/USA**

---

**A Final Evaluation**

**Prepared by**

**An Independent Evaluation Team**

**May 2003**

**FINAL VERSION**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
INTRODUCTION	7
1 THE EVALUATION	8
1.1 Objectives and work methodology	8
1.2 Scope and limitations	9
2 CONSIDERATIONS	11
2.1 Context	11
2.2 Description of the IPEC Mining Program	13
3 RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION	15
3.1 Design and validity of the proposal	15
3.2 Efficacy in performance	17
3.2.1 Awareness-raising component	18
3.2.2 Education component	19
3.2.3 Health component	23
3.2.4 Economic-productive component	24
3.2.5 Organizational component	26
3.2.6 Gender focus	28
3.3 Effects and impacts	30
3.4 Sustainability	33
3.5 Efficiency in carrying out activities	33
3.6 Program organization and management	36
3.6.1 Planning, monitoring and evaluation	36
3.6.2 Implementing teams	37
3.6.3 Budget management	38
4 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	41
4.1 General conclusion	41
4.2 Specific conclusions	41
4.3 Recommendations for Phase II	43

## Executive Summary

This report contains the results of the independent final evaluation of Phase I of the ILO IPEC Program project called “*Program for the Prevention and Gradual Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in South America,*” which was carried out between August 2000 and July 2002 with financial support from the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

The objective has been to provide an independent, analytical view of the Program’s capacity to achieve its proposed results and objectives, with an emphasis on its sustainability. In this regard, the evaluation proposed the following *specific objectives*:

- To analyze the proposal’s design, its grounding in the community and the viability of the strategies employed;
- To evaluate the achievement of the proposed objectives and the initial effects, as well as limitations;
- To analyze the program’s organization and management;
- To examine factors affecting sustainability.

The purpose of this evaluation’s conclusions and recommendations is to guide the implementation of the Program’s second phase. For this reason, the evaluation was seen as an opportunity for reflection on and critical analysis of the processes initiated, their design and grounding in the community, as well as the strategies and outputs, in order to draw conclusions about continuity and future possibilities.

The methodology has sought to provide an overview of the efforts and the richness of the work of the implementing teams in Ecuador, Bolivia and Peru. During the evaluation, information was gathered by zone and by country; an additional effort has also been made to obtain an overall subregional perspective of the achievements of and possibilities for the work carried out by the IPEC-Mining Program during the phase being evaluated (2001-2002).

The principal *conclusion* is that IPEC-Mining took on great challenges and has met its main short-term goals. It has demonstrated that its proposal was valid and relevant in areas characterized by high poverty and social exclusion, such as small-scale traditional mining communities.

Nevertheless, in Ecuador, Peru and Bolivia, either because of the factors related to government policy or characteristics of the implementing teams, the intervention in general and the Direct Action Programs (AP) in particular have shown different levels of progress and results.

In Ecuador, greater progress has been made at the national level and the government has taken on the IPEC/ILO proposal in coordination with other cooperation agencies such as UNICEF. In Peru, while significant progress has been made in raising awareness, progress at the policy level will have to be reinforced as the country’s political and democratic stability becomes more firmly grounded. In Bolivia, the government’s inertia and passivity toward children’s issues requires a reassessment of the intervention strategies and a more forceful demand that the central and local governments assume commitments as a condition for receiving aid.

The APs show a good level of implementation of planned activities. All adapted to local conditions and have demonstrated seriousness and a high level of responsibility in carrying out tasks. There are common elements that could make it possible to design intervention models or basic guidelines for implementing future interventions as a result of these experiences.

The principal *specific conclusions* are:

1. The national surveys were very broad and had to be complemented with local studies and economic feasibility studies. These should have ended with the development of a base line, an analysis of stakeholders and the definition of target group profiles. The national studies could have been better used to revise and adjust the proposal.
2. Although all activities and results have been oriented toward the goal of eliminating child labor, the APs should have included better-designed specific indicators for this objective, sources of verification, assumptions and annual operating plans.
3. The absence of an analysis of external factors, as well as possible predictable and unpredictable effects, had to be addressed after the programs were under way, reducing effectiveness.
4. If there had been an integrated monitoring and evaluation system for IPEC-Mining, it would have been possible to make timely decisions and perform simultaneous, shared monitoring of the 7 APs (through a computerized, networked MEP system). Quarterly reports filled this vacuum to a great degree, but not completely.
5. The APs made significant achievements in raising awareness. The education component has been fundamental to the strategy, as demonstrated by the school enrollment results in all the APs. The health component was highly relevant and had positive results, increasing the number of beneficiaries and their access to health care. The greatest difficulties and/or weaknesses were found in the organizational, economic-productive and technological components, but these problems can be solved.
6. Analysis of efficiency in carrying out the activities shows that there have been delays in several zones. The first year has been dedicated to studies, coordination and the awareness-raising component. Progress was also made in health and education. The area showing the greatest delays has been the economic-productive component. This was partly because technological change requires reaching consensus with the miners' associations and drawing up the necessary designs. In addition, revolving funds require consultation and bidding processes and market studies that have not been done.
7. The implementing teams are small compared to the breadth of the program and put enormous effort into the work, considering that they must travel to the mining communities and live there several days a week. Some teams have less experience in the area; this means that appropriate training for them must be taken into consideration in terms of time and financing.
8. With the postponement of activities or the elimination of some technological investments, more budget funds were shifted to training; this was a good decision.

Observations made during the evaluation enable us to develop a series of *recommendations* and suggestions for a second phase. The main ones are to:

1. Develop a uniform design for the APs that have entered a second phase, systematically documenting and sharing the views and concepts underlying the IPEC Mining proposal.
2. Develop a base line for a sample of families in each zone, based on the indicators in the program's logical framework, differentiated by sex and age group, in order to later evaluate the results in this sample.
3. Update the analysis of the participation of local and national stakeholders as well as external factors that will help solidify the work or constitute obstacles to the second phase.
4. To overcome the weaknesses of the economic-productive and organizational components, we recommend the following:
  - The organizational component requires an updated analysis of the nature of the community and the complexity of its organizations. Strategies should be defined on three levels: the individual level, which involves the identification and solid establishment of natural leaders; organization and internal management; and the level of society, involving the ability to establish synergies and negotiate with other stakeholders and state or private entities to achieve the Program's objectives and those of the communities.
  - For the economic-productive and microenterprise component, an evaluation of the characteristics of each zone is needed based on market studies that can substantiate the profitability and viability of the business or income-generation proposal. In the case of revolving funds, it is advisable to obtain specialized advice about managing them and/or delegate this component.
5. With regard to the Program's organization and management: reinforce the use of participatory methodologies for formulating strategies and monitoring the APs; increase the use of shared management strategies in all components so local people spearhead actions and take ownership of them, acquiring management capacities and skills that the implementing teams must transfer; increase the role of the local community.
6. Institutionalize each component, not leaving it to be sustained by the Program's resources except at the start. There must be a catalyst for mobilizing local or governmental resources to ensure sustainability.
7. Give a greater role to the direct beneficiary population, the children and adolescents. They should strengthen their ability to analyze the problem and lead specific actions, reinforcing their self-esteem, community participation and ability to defend their rights.
8. Perform a participatory evaluation of the National Commissions and redefine roles and commitments. In Ecuador, the emphasis could be on solidifying the progress that has been made, while in Peru and Bolivia the focus should be on a critical, in-depth analysis of the factors — internal and external — that can be addressed effectively to re-establish the commissions. It is important that the cooperation agencies that participate in these commissions do not lead them, so that the issue is addressed with national resources.

9. IPEC Mining must continue to encourage compliance with ILO Convention 138 on the minimum age for admission to work and Convention 182 on the immediate elimination of the worst forms of child labor by the governments of Ecuador, Bolivia and Peru, which are signatories.

## Introduction

The Program of Prevention and Gradual Elimination of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining in South America was carried out by the ILO's IPEC Program between August 2000 and July 2002<sup>1</sup> within the framework of the Memoranda of Understanding signed by the ILO and the governments of Bolivia, Ecuador and Peru on the IPEC Program's cooperation for compliance with international conventions on child labor. The Program has been carried out with financial support from the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

This is the independent final evaluation of the Program. Its results should guide the design and implementation of the second phase; in this regard, the evaluation is considered an opportunity for reflection on and critical analysis of the processes begun by the program, its design and anchoring in the community, as well as strategies and outputs, in order to draw conclusions about future possibilities.

The evaluation has sought to provide an overview of the efforts and richness of the work done by the Project staff and the implementing agencies' teams in Ecuador, Bolivia and Peru, examining both their accomplishments and the difficulties encountered.

The first two chapters describe the objectives, methodology, scope and limitations of the evaluation, as well as the Program's characteristics and the proposal's context. The third chapter presents the evaluation's findings regarding effectiveness, efficiency and management. The fourth chapter offers conclusions and recommendations for the second phase.

In general, the evaluation was broad-based and carried out under optimal conditions with the collaboration the IPEC/Mining Program staff, implementing agencies and interviewees in the three countries, to whom I would like to express my special thanks for their assistance.

---

<sup>1</sup> After the evaluation the deadline was extended to October 2002, making it possible to finish some of the planned actions. This evaluation, however, includes progress as of August, when the visit was made.

# 1. The Evaluation

## 1.1. Objectives and Work Methodology

The main objective of the evaluation is to provide an independent, analytical view of the Program's ability to achieve its objectives and results, taking into account the sustainability of its actions over time.

The objectives of the evaluation were:

- To analyze the proposal's design, its anchoring in the community and the viability of the strategies implemented;
- To evaluate the achievement of the proposed objectives as well as the main limitations;
- To analyze the program's organization and management;
- To examine factors affecting sustainability.

The methodology included both office and field work. The former involved a review of documents about the Program, its periodic reports, the seven Direct Action Programs (APs), the mid-term Program evaluation and the independent evaluations of each AP. The field work was regional, with visits to Ecuador, Bolivia and Peru.

Carlos Asenjo, a Spanish consultant, participated in the field work, providing significant contributions and on-site comments. Visits were made to each IPEC national office, meetings were held with coordinators, and interviews were done with representatives of government agencies (ministries of Education, Labor and Mining), Chambers of Mining, workers' organizations, National Commissions on the Elimination of Child Labor, evaluators of local APs, those responsible for the formulation of the SIMOV monitoring systems and cooperation agencies involved in or closely related to the program (UNICEF Ecuador, REFORMIN Ecuador, GAMA Peru, etc).

For the field visits, one zone of intervention was selected in each country in which the Action Program (AP) is being carried out. The following zones were visited:

- In Bolivia, the field visit was made to Llallagua, where CEPROMIN is the implementing agency for the Action Program. Llallagua is a province in the northern part of the Department of Potosí.
- In Ecuador, the visit was made to Bella Rica, where DESARROLLO Y AUTOGESTION (DyA) is the organization carrying out the Action Program.
- In Peru, La Rinconada in Puno, where the RED TITICACA is the implementing agency, was initially selected for the visit. Because of time constraints and the altitude (5,200 meters above sea level), however, it was difficult to carry out the visit. Nevertheless, an interview was done with the independent consultant who had

just visited the La Rinconada Action Program (Enrique Nolte), and his evaluation report was taken into consideration.<sup>2</sup>

For these reasons, the field visit in Peru was made to Santa Filomena (AP carried out by COOPERACION). Although this intervention was in a more advanced stage, it was representative in the sense that the strategies used were the same ones implemented by IPEC in the other areas. In this case, the visit was important because it gave an idea of the possible future of the project and provided important lessons for the continuity of the other APs in the region.

The field visits involved collecting materials that had been produced and holding individual and group interviews with the implementing team, Management Committees, mining organizations (cooperatives and societies), parents, school principals, health care personnel, mayor (in Lallagua), beneficiaries of microenterprise components, children and adolescents who were direct beneficiaries, and community members.

## 1.2. Scope and limitations

Although the evaluation gathered information by zone and country, an extra effort was needed to gain an overview that respected the heterogeneity and specific nature of each case without standardizing, but provided a **regional view** of the progress made and work done during the one-year phase being evaluated.<sup>3</sup>

Besides the APs, the Program involves seminars, awareness-raising campaigns and national actions aimed at raising consciousness about and institutionalizing the fight against child labor in mining. The lack of means for measuring the impact of the awareness-raising actions was a limitation of the project that made it difficult to do a more in-depth evaluation of the effects of the awareness raising. The indicators used by the project mainly measured the scope of the actions in terms of coverage. Therefore it was mainly possible to analyze the awareness-raising actions and their scope and, to a lesser degree, their impact.

In addition, because the evaluation was regional, involving three countries and seven mining areas, it would have required more than 35 days of work because the information gathered was dispersed and little systematic documentation was available yet.

Another limitation of the evaluation was not having planned several work days exclusively with the regional Project office to reflect together on the proposal and its possibilities. While the IPEC Mining coordinator, Dr. César Mosquera, accompanied us throughout the field work, there was not time for this reflection.

It must be emphasized that the importance of this evaluation lies in the gathering of elements for making recommendations for the second phase. Therefore, this is not a final but rather an intermediate evaluation of IPEC Mining's overall performance and program implementation. Some aspects observed during the evaluation have been considered as start-up situations in some cases or viewed as processes. In this sense, in several cases a rigorous evaluation has not been done because it would demand results that could not feasibly be achieved in such a short time.

---

<sup>2</sup> The same was true of all seven APs: interviews were done with the independent consultants who had done the individual evaluations.

<sup>3</sup> IPEC/Mining has independent, in-depth evaluations of each AP; we have tried not to duplicate these efforts.

At the time of the evaluation (August 2002), some project components had not yet been completed. Nevertheless, all the components of the project were evaluated, with the greatest emphasis placed on analyzing their relevance, performance, the possibilities for reaching the expected objectives, effects, probable impacts and sustainability, using the information available at the time of the evaluation.

Finally, we recommend planning a final evaluation when the entire program has ended. To facilitate such an evaluation, work should begin now to define the base line, impact indicators and a regional monitoring and evaluation system to update and advance the quantitative and qualitative systematic documentation of IPEC Mining's processes, products and results at the regional level.

## 2. Considerations

### 2.1. Context

In Ecuador and Peru, the Program intervenes in areas of small-scale traditional gold mining,<sup>4</sup> while in Bolivia it has been implemented in areas where gold, tin and zinc are produced. There are also variations based on whether the work involves placer mining (Tipuani in Bolivia) or underground mining (Bella Rica in Ecuador and La Rinconada and the south-central region of Peru), the predominant work methods and the tasks performed by children; nevertheless, there are extremely significant similarities.

Various factors are involved in child labor in small-scale traditional mining, including the families' poverty, the dominant concept of work as an educational activity from an early age, the precariousness of family ties marked by violence and parental neglect, and the lack of adequate, good-quality educational services that would make parents consider education a profitable investment for the future.

Although some studies show that children's contributions to their families' income may not be significant, in small-scale traditional mining (and probably in other activities, as well as in households where there are serious problems of parental neglect), it contributes significantly. This is related to the fact that fathers keep part of their income for themselves. It should be noted that bars and brothels abound in most mining communities and that there are many families with stepfathers.<sup>5</sup> In Peru, family expenses average US\$174 (in a five-person household, each person lives on only US\$1.16 a day, which does not guarantee even adequate nutrition).<sup>6</sup> In Bolivia, on average, families say their income is US\$168 a month, while in Bella Rica, Ecuador, it is only US\$125 a month.<sup>7</sup>

Some significant variables that explain child labor in this high-risk activity can be found in national legislation, which does not regulate the conditions under which small-scale traditional mining is done and encourages informal, low-yield conditions.

Another key variable is government neglect, which implies the lack of sufficient schools, especially for adolescents. In most of these communities, mine labor tends to be the only way for adolescents to occupy their time. Where schools do exist, the poor quality of instruction tends to discourage parents about their children's real possibility of gaining access to better jobs or going on to post-secondary studies. For this reason, when a family has a slightly higher income, the children are sent to study in nearby cities.

For low-income parents, having their children work in mining from an early age constitutes a job-training strategy even when the majority do not want their children to be miners because of the physical effort and health problems related to this type of work. For families

---

<sup>4</sup> In Ecuador, besides small-scale traditional gold mining, there is significant small-scale traditional mining and quarrying of clay, rock and sand.

<sup>5</sup> In Bella Rica, 95% of women have children from previous relationships and "the new partner rarely takes responsibility for raising children from his companion's previous marriage. Situations of abuse and violence can occur, therefore, and the children are forced to enter the work force prematurely or to leave home." National Study, Ecuador, Page 135.

<sup>6</sup> National Study, Peru. Excludes spending on tools and supplies.

<sup>7</sup> Cf. National studies.

from rural areas, early occupational training is a basic element of socialization and the transmitting of knowledge; unfortunately this is perpetuated in mining areas because of the lack of adequate public education. They also prefer that their children work rather than do nothing and be exposed to the vices prevalent in these communities.

Women and their children carry out various mining tasks, through which they help support the family. Mothers accompany small children in their entry into mine labor, as they perform together such “marginal” tasks as scavenging and sluicing waste rock. In many communities, especially those that are far from cities, mothers have no employment alternative in any other area of production, commerce or services.

It should also be noted that children — whether or not they work in mining — are exposed to the terrible health conditions that characterize mining communities, where processes are used that pollute the environment, and where, in those farthest from cities, there is a lack of potable water, sewer and waste disposal services. Some mining communities are also located in areas where there is a high risk of landslides or are marked by high levels of overcrowding and everyday violence.

In the areas of the Program’s intervention, three types of mining communities have been identified based on their age and access to basic services.

- Mining communities that date from colonial times and are part of or near to cities, such as Potosí and Llallagua in Bolivia, which have better public services and possibilities for employment other than mining, basically in the service and commerce sectors.
- Communities established between the 1960s and 1980s that have seen explosive growth, now have a large population and have developed chaotically, with high rates of overcrowding and crime, such as Bella Rica in Ecuador and La Rinconada in Peru.
- Small communities established beginning in the 1980s, where there are fewer miners. Some have built a public service infrastructure with external assistance, later pressuring the government to put it into operation. This is the case in the communities in south-central Peru, such as Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca. They are far from cities and lack alternative possibilities for development.

In summary, the Program has been carried out in an especially difficult context because of the precariousness of the communities, the absence of public policies designed to increase the formality of this activity, and the lack of policies and actions aimed at eliminating child labor in mining or other activities.

The three countries had different political conditions when the Program began. Bolivia has made progress in decentralization and has a long mining tradition, but has not established specific policies in areas of cooperative mining for carrying out this activity and eliminating child labor. Peru has recently begun a regionalization process but has made little progress in national policy. In both countries, international organizations and cooperation agencies are the ones fostering raised awareness among authorities. In Ecuador, there is greater interinstitutional cohesion regarding this issue and children’s rights.

From a legal standpoint, small-scale traditional mining has not been adequately regulated by national mining legislation, which tends to ignore its specific characteristics. In Bolivia, legally established cooperatives have the same rights and obligations as private industry and concession holders, and most small-scale traditional miners belong to cooperatives. In

Ecuador, most small-scale traditional mining is done by associations that have title to their claims.

In Peru, few cooperatives have such legal recognition, and in many areas there are no associations. Instead, the miners work on their own, which encourages a higher degree of informality. Some cooperatives in Puno and the south-central region have gained concession rights. These cooperatives do not always work in their assigned areas, however. Instead they establish agreements with companies or individuals who hold title to other, more profitable areas. Holding rights to a mining claim is one factor that determines the feasibility of implementing technological changes in small-scale traditional mining. It should be noted that in this context, the approval in January 2002 of the Law for Formalization and Promotion of Small-Scale and Small-Scale Traditional Mining has been especially important. The IPEC Mining Program and the Small-Scale Traditional Mining Network played a key role in its drafting and approval.

Another external factor that creates difficulties for the Program is the lack of public trust in NGO interventions on child labor, especially in La Rinconada and Potosí, which have been the subjects of media campaigns against the exploitation of children.

As a result, IPEC Mining faced great challenges not only because of the breadth of its objectives but because of the extremely complex and even adverse conditions under which it sought to achieve them, at least in the short term.

## **2.2. Description of the Program**

With financial support from USDOL, the Program has been carried out in seven communities in three countries: Potosí, Llallagua and Tipuani in Bolivia; Bella Rica in Ecuador, and Santa Filomena, Mollehuaca and La Rinconada in Peru. IPEC had carried out earlier actions in Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca between 1998 and 2000 with support from AECI.

The Program's development objective is to contribute to the prevention and gradual elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining and improve the quality of life of the (former) working children. Its immediate objectives are:

- 1) At the end of the Program, key public agencies and private organizations, public opinion and the mining communities will be better informed and more aware of the problem of child labor in small-scale traditional mining and the risks related to their entry into this hazardous activity.
- 2) At the end of the Program, key public and private institutions in the three countries will have strengthened their commitment to and capacity for formulating and implementing policies and actions aimed at eliminating child labor in mining.
- 3) At the end of the Program, demonstration experiences in selected mining communities in the three countries will have made possible the withdrawal of children from mining and prevented other children from becoming involved in this activity. Living conditions in the communities will also have improved.

The target population is 2,500 families, with a total of 7,500 children.

The Program involves national and local studies, national and local awareness-raising campaigns, promoting National Commissions on the Elimination of Child Labor, Direct

Action Programs (APs) in the selected communities and a monitoring system for verifying progress in the prevention and gradual elimination of child labor in this activity.

The components of the Action Programs are:

- a) Raising the families' awareness
- b) Strengthening the capacities and commitments of local agencies and organizations
- c) Improving education and health care services
- d) Increasing the income of adult family members by improving mining technology and supporting small businesses and income-producing workshops.

An IPEC Mining coordinating office was established in each country and implementing agencies were selected for the APs. The implementing agencies were the NGO *Desarrollo y Autogestión* (DyA) in Ecuador; in Bolivia the *Fundación Medio Ambiente, Minería e Industria* (MEDMIN) in Tipuani, the *Centro de Desarrollo Regional* (CDR) in Potosí, and the *Centro de Promoción Minera* (CEPROMIN) in Llallagua; and in Peru the *Red Titikaka* in La Rinconada, the NGO *CooperAcción* in Santa Filomena, and the *Centro de Estudios Sociales y Publicaciones* (CESIP) in Mollehuaca.

National awareness-raising campaigns were also carried out with the following implementing agencies: in Ecuador, the *Fundación YUPANA*, which specializes in communications; in Peru the *Grupo de Iniciativa por los Derechos de los Niños* (GIN), a national network of 40 organizations that defend the rights of children and adolescents; and in Bolivia the *Fundación MEDMIN*, through a subcontracted team of experts in communication and mobilizing public opinion.

## 3. Results of the Evaluation

### 3.1. Design and Validity of the proposal

The Program is highly relevant because child labor in mining is one of the worst forms of child labor and one of the worst violations of the rights of children and adolescents. IPEC proposed to affect this complex situation, which is shaped by various variables (economic, cultural, organizational, public policy, etc.). Its approach combines actions directed at both the causes and the effects of child labor in small-scale traditional mining, which constitutes a huge challenge that can be met over the medium and long term. Producing change in “causes” such as poverty or attitudes is a good approach for the elimination of child labor, but it implies gradual work over at least three phases and requires competent implementing agencies and teams in the region with the expertise of CEPROMIN and MEDMIN in Bolivia, DYA in Ecuador and COOPERACCION in Peru.

The Program began with studies of the social context, the living, working and organizational conditions characteristic of small-scale traditional mining and the situation of children working in this activity. Some of the studies went into greater depth than others. They analyzed the production process, health, nutrition and education and identified local stakeholders. Both the national and local studies, however, were carried out after the programs had already begun and did not play a role in shaping the initial strategies, serving more to raise awareness for the formulation of policy.

Action Programs in areas where there had been earlier interventions (Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca in Peru) were assumed to have achieved the objectives set in the previous phases (awareness raising, improvement of services, income generation, vision of local development, strengthening of mining organizations and community empowerment); as a result, the local studies should have examined the potential and feasibility of solidifying and transferring the proposal. The study of La Rinconada, in Peru, was carried out at the beginning of the intervention, and the results were used to adjust the overall model proposed for the APs, wisely reducing the number of intervention components from five to four for the first phase (the economic-productive component was not considered).

The main objective guiding the APs’ intervention strategies went through three formulations, with different levels of expected results:

- a). Some were aimed at “contributing to the gradual elimination of child labor,” that is, they took the medium- or long-range approach necessary for such a complex problem. One concern, however, is that the objective was different for the APs in Peru, where it was stated as “to solidify a sustainable model of socio-economic development without child labor in small-scale traditional mining,” although no profile was developed for this model and it seems to be more a slogan than an objective.
- b). Other APs formulated the objective in terms of “elimination” without considering the gradual nature of this process; it is unrealistic to expect to eliminate child labor in such a short period.
- c). The earliest APs (Mollehuaca and Santa Filomena) proposed objectives related to access to and improvement and sustainability of the health care and education services implemented, as well as improvement in income and the strengthening of organizations for local development. In its initial phase, the La Rinconada AP was wisely the most conservative, limiting its intervention to four objectives: raising community awareness,

encouraging organization, increasing the children's access to education and improving their health.

It would have been desirable, therefore, to add objectives that could have been achieved feasibly in the short term. Long-term planning is desirable as a basis for establishing short-term objectives that are sequential, from less to greater, that lead to the various program phases on the basis of the financial and professional resources available and the intervention areas agreed to by ILO and USDOL. In practice, rather than eliminating child labor, this first phase has resulted in a decrease in the work hours of children who perform tasks outside the mine. While this is a significant result, the lack of a medium- and long-range strategy that would give coherence to the APs in each zone makes it difficult to measure progress in the objective of eliminating child labor.

The studies of the problem that were carried out in each mining zone, as well as the documents of the APs implemented, describe a series of jobs performed by children depending on type of mining done in each zone. These jobs include extraction of ore in the mine (underground, surface or placer), the selection of discarded ore, transportation of ore and treatment of ore to extract the valuable component. Most of these activities take place outside the mine but are part of the mining process.

In practice, rather than the elimination of child labor, the project's first phase has resulted in a decrease in the work hours of children who perform jobs outside the mine. This confirms IPEC's gradual impact and effects, and must be taken into consideration when establishing objectives that can be met during a project as short as this one. It must be clear from the start that objectives aimed at "eradication" are medium- to long-range objectives.<sup>8</sup>

The specific objectives are very broad and complex. They refer to five components, each of which could be a project in itself if care is not taken to establish linkages and synergies.

One element that must be reinforced in the future is analysis of assumptions or external factors that influence implementation. It would have been important to analyze key factors such as willingness to change the miners' location (in Santa Filomena), migration of families from Bella Rica (to San Gerardo) or unilateral decisions by mining companies or associations. These unforeseen external factors affect the Program and will influence the sustainability of its results.

With regard to activities, several difficult challenges arose that had to be overcome in just one intervention phase. These included:

- More activities related to the families' culture and practices. An indicator that measures changes in family practices, as well as specific outputs and activities related to the adoption of family strategies for the elimination of child labor in mining, would be a key input for ensuring lasting results.

---

<sup>8</sup> Note from IPEC: According to the Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labour, 1999 (N° 182) and Recommendation 190, the definition of hazardous forms of child labour is the responsibility of the national governments. In the three countries included in this project, this process is still ongoing (with IPEC support). Although IPEC recognizes that this determination should be the result of the national consultation process, in general IPEC considers that most tasks performed by children in the mining sector imply serious threats to their health, safety, morality and normal development, and therefore should be considered hazardous. IPEC's goal is the elimination of child labour in the mining sector. However, as the evaluation points out, this goal can only be achieved in the medium to long term.

- Implementation of economic alternatives based on prior studies. To ensure an integral design, economic and job training alternatives must be based on a market study from the start.
- The donation and credit component should be redesigned. A study of the economic feasibility of loans is needed. Experience shows that sustainability mechanisms are sometimes distorted and become a sort of handout when loans are not repaid or small businesses do not achieve the results that the families expect.<sup>9</sup> In the case of donations, scholarships and nutrition services helped achieve the objective of re-enrolling the children in school, but in the future this will depend on unstable efforts by the central government and on pressure from the community for the government or local entities to share responsibility for these programs and manage resources efficiently.
- Education and health-care activities directly favor children. Health care activities and those aimed at improving education to encourage students to re-enroll and foster better school performance were the best designed, perhaps because, as social projects, they involved an area in which most of the implementing teams had more experience. It was very relevant to include in the design broader opportunities for the children's integral development through extracurricular and recreational activities and the good use of free time (e.g., vacation camps), all of which fostered development of their creativity, self-esteem, socialization and vision of the future, encouraging them to distance themselves from mining activity.
- Differentiated planning is needed for the transfer and sustainability phases. In the transfer phase, such as that in Mollehuaca and Santa Filomena, activities and inputs must not include new activities (e.g., installation of alternative technologies, design of training modules and materials, surveys, prevention campaigns, etc.), because a transfer and sustainability project must focus on outputs that have been achieved and on the role of local organizations and stakeholders. The role of the implementing agency must be to gradually withdraw, transferring capacities for autonomous management and monitoring performance and the assumption of responsibilities by entities such as Local Committees.<sup>10</sup>

Just as key objectives and indicators are needed, because of the magnitude of the intervention it is recommended that central activities be clearly defined to ensure their accomplishment and effectiveness, focusing them rather than dispersing them so as not to weaken their effects and impact.

## 3.2. Efficacy in Performance

For methodological reasons, this topic has been organized by components: Awareness Raising, Education, Health, Economic-Productive and Organizational.

---

<sup>9</sup> With regard to the credit component, in most APs no prior analysis was done of the feasibility of the microenterprises. The agricultural feasibility study in Mollehuaca was a good idea.

<sup>10</sup> The Processing Plant in Santa Filomena is still important. Its implementation, however, does not fall within the project timeline; moreover, the Plant would probably begin operation ex post (around November 2002). This means that theoretically its effects on child labor could not be ascertained, nor would monitoring and adjustment be possible.

### 3.2.1. Awareness-Raising Component

Significant results are observed in communities that are addressing the issue of child labor for the first time. In Ecuador, 50% of the children and adolescents (137) participate in the program's services in Bella Rica and are in the process of withdrawing from mining activity. Eighty percent (257) of children and adolescents have been prevented from entering child labor in small-scale traditional mining. Fifty percent (25) of adolescents are involved in a protected income-generating activity. All the families (259) have been informed about the harmful effects of small-scale traditional mine labor on children and the 42 mining societies have been informed and have been involved in awareness-raising about the program to eliminate child labor.

In Bolivia, although the problem of child labor was not reversed in this first phase,<sup>11</sup> there was an interesting combination of large-scale strategies and more focused strategies involving awareness raising, radio spots, posters, stickers, public activities and Olympics that transmitted positive messages about children's rights, as well as workshops, debates, and group work with children and adolescents and their families. The Tipuani AP disseminated the results of its study and used posters and radio spots about children's rights. According to its self-evaluation, it reached 100% of the population involved in the intervention; qualitatively, it indicates that its accomplishments have included motivating participation by all sectors and zones as well as stimulating dialogue and reflection about the need to eliminate child labor.

In the two earliest APs, awareness raising has been part of a sustained, ongoing process that began in earlier years. The evaluation verified that in Santa Filomena children no longer go into the mines, although some still operate *quimbaletes*. In Mollehuaca, there are only 15 minors still working in mining, but their work hours have decreased. Awareness raising in these areas was oriented toward transfer and sustainability, which implied laying a solid foundation for local organizations that would assume and translate the proposal into specific, sustainable actions to continue eliminating child labor. In this regard, it was noted that in 2002 the Local Committee in Mollehuaca still had not achieved the expected results, mainly because it lacked legitimacy. The Local Committee in Santa Filomena is much stronger, although it still needs to "listen" to the demands of children and adolescents (e.g., recreation). The situation in Santa Filomena shows that child labor in mining has been overcome and the ore processing plant probably will be the factor that firmly establishes that achievement.

In what amounts to the third intervention phase in these two communities, CESIP and CooperAcción jointly prepared the publication "Awareness-Raising Material for the Prevention of Child Labor in Small-Scale Traditional Mining," which includes methodological guides and materials for addressing the issue with parents, teachers and children. A series of workshops and festivals on children's rights was also developed.

The La Rinconada AP, which had been under way for less than a year when the evaluation began, proposed linking this component with strategies involving communication (radio), community organization (children's and youth organizations, etc.), education and health (artistic and cultural activities, school enrollment, community oversight). From the outset, its model linked awareness raising to the education and health components, which were carried out simultaneously. Sustainability was also included in the "District Development Plan," which is in the formulation stage. One significant achievement is that with about

---

<sup>11</sup> Cf. Local evaluations.

US\$140,000 and a small team of three full-time people, the number of work hours of about 500 children and adolescents were reduced so they could dedicate themselves to school and organized cultural activities. The elimination of child labor in mining activity has not yet been achieved, however.

We can conclude that the actions of the APs that have been under way for a year have made it possible to begin processes aimed at the prevention and elimination of child labor in mining. During the visits, some mining communities showed a certain degree of passivity or limited motivation and initiative toward the issue and the proposal to eliminate child labor. This does not mean, however, that the APs have not mobilized the population to participate in the proposed activities. It would be advisable to continue a large-scale educational campaign to more firmly establish the proposal and ensure that the community takes a leading role.

The Program's first objective, involving awareness raising in the mining communities, had to be aimed at the prevention and gradual elimination of child labor in small-scale traditional mining. For this reason, the APs opted to provide information about the harm and risks that this activity poses for children and adolescents, as an entry point for addressing the issue of child labor with parents. The general model is one of one-way communication (sender → receiver), with the goal of gradually convincing the receiver of the benefits of each component. The APs have used the best resources and skills to carry out this component; for this reason, it is important to systematically document the experience so as to develop a unified approach, arrive at indicators for measuring the impact of the awareness raising<sup>12</sup> and determine the methodologies, types, formats and materials that achieved the greatest comparative advantages.

### **3.2.2. Education Component**

This component is central to the strategy for eliminating child labor; for this reason, having a full-time educator in all APs would have been most appropriate for the studies, establishment of the base line, monitoring and evaluation of the component, particularly in areas where there was a great educational "poverty" or lack of services.

This component has been relevant in mining communities where the lack of quality public education forces children and adolescents out of the school system and leads parents to see a greater good in child labor, which helps supports the family and provides job training not offered by the educational system. In this context, the Program has been key in promoting school enrollment, offering extracurricular activities and making good use of free time (recreation, art) in order to foster self-esteem, children's rights, school enrollment and gradual withdrawal from work in small-scale traditional mining.

Creating demonstrative effects with some degree of rigor through the APs is important for the strategies for eliminating child labor. It has been proven that the educational component has created the greatest demonstrative effects in all zones of intervention.

In Ecuador, the main achievement has been the construction of the new school, which is impeccable and attractive to both children and teachers (built with the participation of parents, the Cooperative and the government, represented by the school principal). The

---

<sup>12</sup> It is not possible to measure the impact of the process during its implementation, this must be done at the end of the intervention because it involves changes in attitudes and behaviors.

elimination of scholarships (which would have led to conflicts among parents) was a good idea; extracurricular activities, teacher training and the vacation camp were maintained. A base line, which would have provided greater depth in the survey results, would have made it possible to compare the changes, improvements and progress resulting from the Program. Another substantive contribution was the creation of a recreational facility that provides children with a place to learn through play outside school hours; this is especially important for very young children in an area lacking recreational infrastructure. It also reinforces socialization, fine motor skills and creativity, which are appreciated by parents and highly valued by the children.

An external factor that contributed to success in this component in Ecuador was the level of participation and interest in improving teaching quality on the part of parents, teachers, the school principal, local authorities and the Bella Rica Cooperative. This is one more proof that education is important to the community and that child labor is probably a replacement alternative when there is a lack of sufficient quality public education.<sup>13</sup>

In a second phase, we recommend finding viable alternatives for solving the problem of the lack of the three last years of secondary school, so that adolescents do not have to work to pay the US\$8 monthly fee in alternative educational institutions outside Bella Rica which only operate on weekends.<sup>14</sup>

In Bolivia, the program addressed not only formal school enrollment, which is important, but also supportive educational and extracurricular activities. For example, we find that in Llallagua the establishment of the library and training courses provided complementary educational opportunities that did not previously exist in the community. They are appropriate to the ages of the children and adolescents, play a formative role and provide an opportunity for the good use of free time. Thirty children a day use the library, while 49 take advantage of the computer courses through scholarships from two local institutes.

The children and adolescents in Llallagua, however, had better communication skills and greater knowledge of their rights (the Rights of the Child) than similar groups in other areas visited. The implementing agency in Llallagua, CEPROMIN, was working simultaneously on another project supported by a European agency called Tierra de Hombres with an approach of critical valuing of child labor. An appropriate combination of IPEC's approach with that of Tierra de Hombres resulted in a discourse and an intervention that favored the elimination of the worst forms of child labor (such as mining) and the protection of working adolescents who are of working age and engaged in activities permitted by law (that do not violate their rights). Through this approach, CEPROMIN placed greater emphasis on working for children's rights and on aspects of "integral development" related to these rights (e.g., health care, education, personal development, etc.). This particular case is of interest and can be taken into consideration in reinforcing the APs.

In Potosí, 100 adolescents benefited from educational materials and better school conditions and were trained in different technical areas. The cost of their studies was paid and they were provided with materials for practical exercises.

In Tipuani, new classrooms were added to schools and, most importantly, a library was established with highly relevant effects and impacts for school-age children and adolescents, contributing to their formation and motivating them to return to the classroom. Recreational and cultural activities attended by the placer mining families have provided important opportunities for the good use of free time, promoted children's rights and raised awareness about child labor. These activities have had a positive influence on the children's self-esteem.

---

<sup>13</sup> The proposal of pedagogical innovation in public schools may not have been best, however, because it implies an educational model that is difficult to adapt to the real situation. The proposal, based on Freinet's Active Education Model, implied several conditions: fewer than 20 students per classroom (the state average is 30 to 40 students); materials for play and discovery, and rooms for research and investigation. For this reason, the proposal was not well accepted by all teachers; it should be adapted to public schools and reinforcement should be provided for teachers based on Ecuador's 1996 Basic Curriculum Reform.

<sup>14</sup> It must be kept in mind that adolescents without guidance and without a good way to use their free time are highly vulnerable to establishing families prematurely, perpetuating the cycle of poverty and child labor.

In Peru, the earliest programs aimed to provide training and validate educational methodologies, maintain a good enrollment rate (timely enrollment campaigns), provide material support and encourage children's educational development, avoiding their return to mining activity or reinforcing the elimination of child labor. The solid establishment and transfer of educational and health-care services should be done with the participation of local organizations, but the state must assume responsibility. During the evaluation, this transfer still had not occurred and there were unresolved conflicts in the schools between teachers and the principal.

In Santa Filomena, specifically, the objective of training teachers was achieved through workshops in which a new approach of curriculum by competency was introduced.<sup>15</sup> Training was provided on such topics as significant learning, integral projects, learning units, children's rights in education, the institutional development project, curriculum diversification and parents' schools. Three hundred children have remained in school and are not working in mining, which is an optimal result. The AP made a decisive contribution through the campaign for timely enrollment at the beginning of the school year.<sup>16</sup>

In Mollehuaca, the strategy of solidifying progress was oriented toward strengthening educational resources and the transfer of all goods provided by the AP to the education sector in order to ensure their maintenance and replacement. The AP report and local external evaluation indicate good levels of achievement, with 92% of the community's children and adolescents attending school, and a good level of graduation from one grade to the next (97.9%). During the third phase, training was provided for all teachers, a mini-library was equipped and school furnishings, supplies and uniforms (279 daypacks) were donated. While the latter constituted a handout, it was a determining factor in the school attendance of a number of children and their siblings; it remains to be determined who will underwrite this cost in future years.

The strategic focus of the La Rinconada AP was to solve the educational deficit, which was one of the main causes of child labor. When the AP began, the local school covered only 6.7% of the population. The AP proposed the construction of six additional classrooms, making it possible for another 500 children to enroll, thereby withdrawing them from mine labor or at least reducing their work hours. The Red Titikaka, in coordination with the educational community, arranged with INFES for the construction of six additional classrooms (pre-fabricated) for primary students and with the Temporary Regional Administration Council (*Consejo Transitorio de Administración Regional*, CTAR) for the construction of two permanent classrooms for secondary students. A total of 14 new classrooms have been constructed as part of the intervention. In addition, INEI and FONCODES have begun providing various types of support to the community, with the former providing technical assistance for a census carried out in April 2002 and the latter supporting community strategic planning and three social assistance projects. Overall, authorities from the education and health sectors, INEI and FONCODES have begun to adopt IPEC's philosophy.

In La Rinconada, direct promotion activities were carried out with parents and teachers to motivate them with regard to children's education and improving the quality of instruction. This objective was partially accomplished. Although enrollment and attendance increased by as much as 30%, internal conflicts among teachers were not resolved. The education component also included increasing the number of children who passed to the next grade, which was achieved for 750 students. It also aimed to motivate children to participate in

---

<sup>15</sup> Taken from the Program for Improvement of Educational Quality, MECEP/PLANCHAD/MED.

<sup>16</sup> Conflicts among the primary school teachers have not been resolved, however, and parents are reluctant to send their children to school.

extracurricular recreational and cultural activities, benefiting a large number of children (1,050).

In the future, we recommend the measurement of such indicators as the number of families that have encouraged their children to attend school and participate in extracurricular activities, the number of children to reduced their work hours in mining and the numbers of children who have left mining to attend school. These are key indicators for evaluating and validating the intervention model of all the APs.

### **3.2.3. Health Component**

This component was consistent with PAHO's "Primary Health Care" model, which has been disseminated throughout the region, and was carried out by most Health Centers in the zones of intervention. The centers are required to follow up the health care of mining families and establish local action strategies.

With support from ISAT, an institution specializing in occupational health and safety, representative studies were conducted in the mining communities of Santa Filomena, Mollehuaca and La Rinconada to determine the overall state of health and the children's levels of environmental and occupational exposure.

In general, health care in the zones of intervention was strengthened in close collaboration with the government to avoid duplicating functions or replacing government services. Valid, effective strategies have been implemented, coinciding with projects with similar characteristics carried out by international cooperation agencies, but it would be advisable to establish greater synergies with the awareness-raising component so that the families internalize the seriousness of the effects of mine labor on their children.

In Ecuador, the groups of beneficiary children and families numbered 279 and 259, respectively. When the evaluation was done, achievement in this area was only partial. The last report, done in the third quarter, indicates that 90% of the children had medical diagnoses, 25% had received medical checkups, 90% were involved in school nutrition programs, 63% had all their immunizations and 27% of families had received information about basic health and hygiene practices.

The active support and participation of health-care personnel is a key factor that has contributed to the efficiency and efficacy of the activities in this component. Support in establishing the People's Pharmacy, the acquisition of medicines, the effort to reactivate the Center for Diagnosis and Treatment of Mining Illnesses in the Bella Rica Cooperative, the health and hygiene campaigns and the basic sanitation and environmental works in the area (which also had support from PRODEMİNCA) have been fundamental and confirm the efficacy and sustainability of interventions based on strategies involving civil society and government participation.

In Bolivia, the lack of health-care services is more notorious, as seen in the high demand for services by the community in general, beyond that motivated by the program. As a result, this component involved the entire population, and it was not possible to distinguish between the children who worked in small-scale traditional mining and those who did not.

In Llalagua, the Health Center achieved significant results in the number of medical consultations handled by the clinic and infirmary. The weakness is that the health-care professionals' entire salary is paid by the AP and there is still no assurance that the local government will assume the financing of these positions to ensure their continuity.

In Potosí, coverage was expanded and quality increased, with improvement in equipment and infrastructure of health services, benefiting youths as well.

In Tipuani, space was prepared for a Health Center under an agreement with Local Committees, the local government and the Municipal Hospital to ensure continuity (the communities provided the space). The AP provided materials, furnishings, instruments and medicines. Medical care for placer mining families, who received health-care ID cards, was a great achievement. Common illnesses (diarrheal and respiratory illnesses) in more than 60% of children were treated at no charge.<sup>17</sup>

The earliest APs in Peru operated with the “Healthy Communities” approach. Transfer and sustainability were proposed in this new model of Community and Extramural Care. In Santa Filomena, efforts were made to reinforce the health center’s work. This was achieved in part because the staff is extremely committed to the community.

The transfer and sustainability of the health component in Mollehuaca were related to the nutrition service provided by the Mothers Club with government assistance. Support was provided to families to help them more solidly establish their mini-plots and the bakery. Basic water, electricity and garbage services were to be transferred to community organizations using communal management models. The effective improvement of the health center (medical instruments, medicines, preventive actions) and the strengthening of the community kitchen and child nutrition program with the donation of furnishings and utensils and training in nutrition and management for the women were also effective. All families have access to basic services. They currently have water (37% have household connections), hygiene-related illnesses have decreased from 20 to 14 cases, and there are no longer reported cases of mercury contamination. Management by the Directors Council and CODEMO has improved.<sup>18</sup>

In La Rinconada, 400 families benefited from improved health care services, 100 children have had medical exams and another 750 children in the schools have benefited from the health services and preventive actions.

In the future, the transfer of basic services, and child nutrition program, etc., will have to be resolved so there are no setbacks in the results achieved and progress made so far.

### **3.2.4. Economic-Production Component**

This component was designed as a strategy for the “modernization of small-scale traditional mining and the diversification of income generation in mining communities,” which would make it possible to increase the profits and income of mining families and, therefore, foster the elimination of child labor. The goal was to carry out a training program and reinforce business management skills for women and minors, along with a system of economic support for new or ongoing projects.

The economic-production component, whether in technological improvement or promotion of microenterprises, assumed not only improving family income, especially for women, but also decreasing women’s participation in mining, especially in scavenging or *pallaqueo*,

---

<sup>17</sup> The results must still be more solidly established, but the use of ID cards could be a concrete idea for indirect monitoring of the elimination of child labor.

<sup>18</sup> The community could not be interested in public trash collection, which is an urgent need (a strategy that only functions if all are in agreement).

because this is the task in which they are accompanied by their children during long work days under poor working conditions. Another goal was to increase their contribution to the family income, reversing traditional chauvinistic concepts about women's dependence and helping to increase the participants' self-esteem. This is the component in which the gender perspective is most developed. The influence of technological changes has been at the community level, while that of the microenterprises has been mainly focused on women, with an emphasis on affirmation that is necessary in these zones, because the effect of creating sources of income for women is that their children will not work in mining activities.

This component also sought to reinforce awareness-raising actions with a methodology of "bartering" specific support from the AP for withdrawal of children from mining. This worked in most cases and tends to be applied when immediate eradication effects are sought, although it does not imply a change of attitudes that would provide sustainability.<sup>19</sup>

In Ecuador, interesting income-generation ideas were initiated, such as the goldsmithing workshop and the raising of small animals, with the aid of training, technology and loans. Women are the most enthusiastic and have great expectations about improving their situation, knowing that in return their children must be withdrawn from work in small-scale traditional mining.

In Llalagua, Bolivia, a feasibility study was done for the implementation of a mill for grinding tin ore that would replace child labor on *quimbaletes*, but there was a lack of community interest and the issues of supply and profitability must be analyzed because of the low price of tin. Toward the end of the AP, the decision was made to replace this technological component with the establishment of a workshop that would provide soldering services; the results of this alternative have not been observed. Nevertheless, men in the community have high expectations that the soldering workshop will increase their low incomes. Training for mothers in such areas as sewing and shoemaking has been met with enthusiasm and is helping them recover their self-esteem.

In Potosí, support was provided for the establishment of microenterprises, training women in four areas: pastry making, handcrafts, cooking and knitting. In both Potosí and Tipuani, activities were carried out to identify alternative technologies, providing training and technical assistance in occupational safety and environmental care. The establishment of various commercial production units (pig farms, tilapia farms, agricultural units, etc.) is interesting and appears to have served as a catalyst for the local economy. A study of this area is recommended. Environmental and occupational elements were taken into account, with simple, familiar, low-cost alternatives, such as grindstones, channels and new ways of amalgamating the ore to recover the gold without using mercury. Nevertheless, the time and resources allocated are not sufficient for the challenges to be addressed, and it was necessary to define timelines and levels of progress.

In Santa Filomena, Peru, alternative technology (the introduction of an electric winch for transporting ore) to improve mining profitability without child labor had been promoted from earlier years. The current phase included plans for a mini-plant for ore processing, to take the place of the *quimbaletes* used to crush and amalgamate the ore. This part of the project was delayed, however, and was not complete at the time of the evaluation. In Mollehuaca, this phase included plans for the introduction of retorts to reduce the impact of mercury pollution.

---

<sup>19</sup> Children can be withdrawn while the Program is under way, but ensuring a sustainable result requires complementary processes and strategies and the parents' internalization of the changes.

In both communities, revolving funds were also implemented so that women could start small businesses. As part of the Program to Support New Economic Initiatives for Women (*Programa de apoyo a nuevas iniciativas económicas de mujeres*, PANIEM), more than 60 mothers had been trained in designing projects during the previous phase, and financing had been approved for 14 initiatives. The results were encouraging, with most of the businesses becoming stable and paying back the loans. During the second phase, support continued for the women's enterprises and a training and loan program was added for miners, aimed at the installation of the mini-plant. The idea is that these funds operate as community revolving funds managed by the women (\$15,000) and the miners (\$75,000) to continue contributing to improvement of the local economy. The limitation has been the time available for supporting new initiatives and doing follow up as local residents develop the capacity to manage the allocated funds. The AP considers this a sequential process in which the women and the miners currently share responsibility for managing the funds with CooperAcción.

In Mollehuaca, the workshops (goldsmithing, sewing, knitting and the bakery) must address the issue of marketing. The cost is high in comparison to the benefits, which according to the participants in the sewing workshop range from US\$10 to US\$20 a month. The challenge is sustainability, so the workshops become a source of income for the families. The program to provide training in business management and the contribution of production machinery is an important step in this regard.

In this community, approximately US\$16,000 was invested in expanding the agricultural area by 2.3 hectares, training small farmers and providing start-up capital (seed and fertilizers). Slightly more than 70 families are participating, with an initial investment of about US\$258 each. Unlike the workshops, there is a greater probability that the small farmers will continue and that an impact on their families' diet will be visible within several years.

It is important to keep in mind that in isolated mining communities such as Santa Filomena, Bella Rica and Mollehuaca, the local market is severely limited and there is a high probability that the market will become saturated. It would be advisable for the ILO to establish agreements with public universities to carry out studies and foster macroregional linkages to ensure success in this area.<sup>20</sup> More in-depth studies of feasibility and profitability should also be done of the small businesses, and management plans should be designed to make them viable. The challenge for the new APs is to measure the degree to which the planned activities have been carried out and the feasibility of increasing income.

### **3.2.5. Organizational Component**

This component was well oriented toward approval of the proposal and empowerment of local organizations to sustain a model of development in mining without child labor. This means strengthening their capacity to assume responsibilities and raising their awareness about the problem and the risks of child labor, as well as transferring skills for organization and management so they can take charge of the proposal and establish synergies and agreements with other local stakeholders in defense of children's rights. Finally, all projects must be approved and coordinated by the local people themselves so that they mobilize resources for their own benefit.

---

<sup>20</sup> In the case of Llalagua, analyzing the impacts of fluctuations in international tin prices, whose downturns exacerbate difficulties and inhibit the local community from assuming any other risk.

From the outset the organizational situation in the zones of intervention had, in general, a three-part common denominator:

1. The mining communities had a greater or lesser degree of distrust in things that were new or strange, partly because the informality in which they work makes them fear that legal steps will be taken to remove them or that others will enter in search of gold or rob them.
2. The communities' central organization consists of male miners; there is not an organizational culture that includes women's participation.
3. Child labor in mining was part of their natural means of survival, and although some NGOs had already tried to address the problem, there had been no effective influence until IPEC's arrival.

The work was carried out in a context of extremely complex external factors that should be studied in greater depth in the future.<sup>21</sup> Despite these difficulties, in this component the APs implemented a series of strategies to bring people together, encourage dialogue and foster organization in conjunction with the awareness-raising component.

In Ecuador, unprecedented organizational work was done with youths (a youth music group was formed that is now well known and highly regarded) and an organization of goldsmiths was formed (linked to the goldsmithing workshop), along with a Parents' Committee (for improvements in education) and a Local Management Committee whose goal is to mobilize groups interested in small businesses and local development. These organizations have been effective in their initial work (artistic activities, jewelry sales, construction of a new school and establishment of family chicken farms, respectively). The AP has established linkages with public health and education services, the cooperative and mining societies. The Mining Cooperative has assumed a shared role in implementation, overcoming its initial distrust and acknowledging the existence of the problem of child labor. An important Provincial Interinstitutional Committee has been formed to work to eliminate child labor in Bella Rica. Its challenge is to establish a relationship with similar zones in Azuay and El Oro, the communities to which families migrate and to which the problem could be shifted in the future.

In Bolivia, the Llallagua and Tipuani APs were more developed than that of Potosí, where there were problems with the internal coordination of the AP and because the size and complexity of the city. In Tipuani, the Interinstitutional Committee that was created has become well established. In Llallagua, the Ombudsman's Office for Children was an ally and an institutional commission has been established in which IPEC could participate. Among the results are promotional sporting and artistic activities. In Potosí, an interinstitutional network was promoted initially, with some delays. Its statutes and action plans must still be defined.

In the earlier APs in Peru, a certain weakness was noted in the community and grassroots organizations, demonstrating the complexity of this component and serving as a warning of the need to work on this issue in greater depth in the next phase in the various zones in order to solidify the progress made with organizations. A Local Management Committee has been formed in Santa Filomena, but it must still become more firmly established in order to achieve the same degree of legitimacy as the mining organization SOTRAMI. The

---

<sup>21</sup> The analysis of stakeholder participation is a useful instrument for this. It is applied in a participatory manner with those involved, encouraging discussion of perceptions of the problem, their interest in solving it, sustainable strategies for doing so, and the parties with whom conflicts have arisen.

latter, with the Program's support, has become stronger with its incorporation into the Association of Small-Scale Traditional Miners of the South-Central Region (*Asociación de Mineros Artesanales del Sur Medio*), where IPEC could have an influence through lobbying and policy advocacy to expand its work to eliminate child labor in the south-central area.

In Mollehuaca, the lack of participation and inability to mobilize the local community, as well as infighting among community leaders, slowed down the process of legitimizing the Community Development Council (*Consejo Comunal de Desarrollo*, CODEMO). Further support is needed to strengthen its organizational and management capacities. The leadership training that has been done has been an important step in this direction.

Significant progress was made in La Rinconada, fostering the formation of the Development Council, implementing a Leadership and Management School from which 20 leaders have graduated, and designing a Strategic Plan for the community. In this first year, work has focused on developing the community fabric necessary to ensure sustainability, with the formation of various organizations such as the Youth Councils in La Rinconada, Cerro Lunar and Ananea and the Association for the Defense of Women and the Family (*Asociación de Defensa de la Mujer y la Familia*). The awareness-raising component is also helping to overcome distrust among miners and local authorities.

As a result, this component has made great strides, some incipient and others more firmly established. They demonstrate the degree of mobilization and assertiveness that most of the APs have achieved in a short period and under complex socio-cultural conditions. The weakness of certain organizations, however, makes it necessary to work more to strengthen them and build their internal management capacity.

In conclusion, the series of five components analyzed has enabled us to determine that those related to awareness raising, education and health have achieved the greatest levels of efficacy. In the case of future replication, these could be the most viable in a first phase.

The economic-productive and microenterprise component has drawn the greatest interest from women, and in some cases it has helped them replace their children's economic contribution. These actions, however, require more in-depth examination, analysis and technical expertise. This could be done through other projects with which the ILO could collaborate and coordinate, as well as with support from the government or private enterprise to improve economic conditions in the mining communities.

The organizational component is always the most complex and requires a clearly defined social focus in order to develop flexible strategies and procedures adapted to each situation. It must be kept in mind that this is more complex in large cities where lobbying and political advocacy can be a complementary activity.

### **3.2.6. Gender Focus**

The APs took into account the importance of differentiating among boys and girls and adolescents in some studies and in the formulation of their objectives, results and activities, although they did not include gender indicators and information about differentiated treatment is not included regularly or for all APs in the reports on their implementation. Thus, while the gender dimension was considered by program planners, there are some gaps in formulation and implementation.

These include:

- Analysis of the various groups involved could be more refined in identifying the needs of adult men and women, as well as girls and boys (children and adolescents) in each component.
- Economic, social, environmental, technical and organizational factors related to small-scale traditional mining lead to a division of labor by gender and differences in access to, control over and benefits from resources. These must be made explicit if IPEC is to develop a gender focus.
- The APs project the image of having understood “mining societies” and “cooperatives” as male spheres; while this is true to a certain degree, it is a generalized view that only reinforces the traditional gender divisions in small-scale traditional mining.
- In both the APs and the National Campaigns, there is a need to examine in greater depth and place greater emphasis on gender-based social, economic and cultural roles, attributes and differences seen in the mining communities. In this sense, the APs took a “neutral,” permissive stance on the invisibility of women’s economic contribution or such issues as violence and parental neglect.<sup>22</sup>
- Although income-generation activities for women were designed, this does not mean there has been a change in the position of adult or adolescent women. In addition, the programs did not take advantage of activities aimed at solving problems related to practical needs (e.g., basic services) to address gender-related issues in the community.<sup>23</sup>

In summary, there was a gender focus in the initial formulation of the Program. Although differentiated terms (“boys, girls and adolescents”) have been used, however, these were not made operational in activities, and the reports tend to condense data with no positive discrimination among the results.

Finally, strategies that should be developed in a participatory manner must define courses of action to empower women with a focus on equity in these socio-economic areas where there are high levels of exclusion and social marginalization. Empowerment is both an objective and a development strategy for achieving equity. It must respond to strategic gender-related needs and implies “making visible” women’s contributions in both the productive and reproductive spheres. Without gender equity, the application of sustainable development policies and the APs’ proposals for integral development without child labor will have limited effects in many ways.

---

<sup>22</sup> The project did not contribute to transforming the traditional distribution of the benefits of mining between men and women. Nor did it address the problem of abuse of women and children, which frequently occurs because of high rates of alcoholism.

<sup>23</sup> In meetings with women, their analysis emphasized the importance and position of male miners. In mixed meetings of the Management Committees, it was also clear that women participate less.

### 3.3. Effects and Impacts

It is too soon to examine the effects and impacts of programs that have had such a short duration and that must continue into a second phase.<sup>24</sup> What we will analyze in this section, therefore, is the direction of possible local impacts as well as the campaigns, commissions and national monitoring systems that have an impact and influence at the policy level, which are among the program's objectives.

The greatest progress has occurred in Ecuador, where groundwork has been laid for incorporating IPEC Mining's objectives into the work of the National Commission on Elimination of Child Labor. Results are visible in the Ministry of Labor, which will assume responsibility for the Monitoring and Verification System proposed by IPEC, as well as among other agencies, such as the Ministry of Energy and Mines and the Chamber of Mining, which have expressed concern about the phenomenon of child labor in small-scale traditional mining.<sup>25</sup>

In this context, the media have played an important role, providing information about the problem since 2001. The first phase of the National Campaign carried out by the NGO YUPANA (at IPEC's request) has fostered minimal agreements about the problem of child labor. YUPANA, a qualified organization with experience in social communication, indicates that the communications phase must still be more firmly established in order to forge consensus and alliances that lead to results in the elimination of child labor.

In February 2002, a Declaration for the Elimination of Child Labor was signed by ministers, employers and workers. A multidisciplinary approach to the problem has been taken at the national level. Progress has been made with mining companies, while trade unions must still include the issue in their collective agreements. A pending task is to disseminate information about the program's objectives among schools, teachers and the indigenous sector.

With regard to replicating or disseminating Bella Rica's results nationwide (modeling), it is still necessary to more firmly establish the actions, results and objectives of an intervention that has only been under way for a matter of months (less than one year). It is also necessary to systematically document the intervention model in order to disseminate it.

In Bolivia, the effects and impacts appear weak despite the efforts of the campaign and the National Commission (SIMOV is in the design process). The institutional and political situation in Bolivia is weaker, making it necessary to repeat actions with new authorities in order to obtain commitments from them. We recommend trying to place the issue of the elimination of child labor on the agendas of the ministries of Labor and Energy and Mines and seeking greater synergies with other cooperation programs, of which Bolivia has many (international cooperation represents 12% of GDP). The ILO must have a greater influence on the Bolivian government regarding its commitments.

In Peru, because the National Commission for the Elimination of Child Labor never began to function, the decision was made to support the Small-Scale Traditional Mining Network, which includes various organizations working for the development of small-scale traditional mining, including the program's partners. The decision was also made to support

---

<sup>24</sup> In Santa Filomena and Mollehuaca, a specific evaluation of impact would be needed.

<sup>25</sup> After the evaluation visit, a Ministerial Agreement was signed in October 2002 establishing the National System for Inspection and Monitoring of Child Labor.

the strengthening of other networks working for the elimination of child labor, such as GIN and the Network for a Future without Child Labor.

The National Campaign carried out by GIN was aimed at motivating reflection on and disseminating information about the negative effects of mine labor on children. It focused on areas where the problem exists without duplicating the APs' awareness-raising actions, with which it wisely coordinated.

A mass communication strategy also played an important role in raising awareness among national and local authorities; winning approval of the Law for Promotion and Formalization of Small-Scale Traditional Mining; gaining the commitment of the president of the National Consensus Group for the Fight against Poverty to form a multidisciplinary commission for the elimination of child labor in coordination with the Ministry of Energy and Mines; achieving modification of Article 51 of the Code for Children and Adolescents to raise the age to 14 years; and winning the ratification of ILO Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labor.

One factor that complicated efforts in Peru was the country's political situation and its transition toward democracy, which created instability in public institutions. Despite this context, ongoing advocacy work was done with regional authorities and representatives of the ministries of Energy and Mines, Health, Education and Labor and MIMDES, raising awareness about the issue and motivating their participation in the SIMOV, which was accomplished after the evaluation was done.<sup>26</sup>

In summary, there has been significant progress in legislation and in obtaining commitments, which serves as an initial step or groundwork for IPEC's work. In the future, it will be necessary to strengthen democratic government institutions so they lead and monitor the implementation of policies aimed at eliminating child and adolescent labor such as that in small-scale traditional mining.

The APs in Peru had the following effects in the area of government responsibility:

- With regard to social investment agencies such as FONCODES, their participation in places such as Mollehuaca and La Rinconada has been important, resulting in a more focused use of their resources.<sup>27</sup>
- For government health and education employees, a positive effect has been ongoing training and participation that has improved their image in the community. The same is true with regard to the local governments of La Rinconada.
- The APs have provided an opportunity to reinforce the government's responsibility for addressing the needs of the community, especially children in mining areas who lack protection. One unexpected result, however, is that this effect is somewhat undermined by the lack of coordination among the ministries. The Program could serve as a catalyst for greater interinstitutional coordination in the area of small-scale traditional mining.

In conclusion, there are significant signs of the Program's impact on public policy, despite the short time it has been in effect. It will be necessary to monitor the government's

---

<sup>26</sup> An agreement was signed with five ministries for implementation of the SIMOV.

<sup>27</sup> External evaluations of FONCODES' impact indicate that in the 1990s resources did not reach the poorest sectors. In La Rinconada, FONODES did not want to provide assistance for educational infrastructure in 1999 because it considered the population "transient" even though it had been demonstrated that this was not the case.

commitments and ensure that they are carried out. It is also important that the South America Office continue to foster lobbying and political advocacy processes in each country, reinforcing them especially in Bolivia.

### **3.4. Sustainability**

The most sustainable results of the APs are those related to national policy and health and education. In the policy arena, they are being assumed by governments, and in the health sector by public health centers. High-quality, lasting changes have also been made in educational infrastructure and capacities transferred to teachers and principals.<sup>28</sup>

The APs' microenterprise components are in process or just getting under way, and the lack of feasibility and market studies (beyond the local or subsistence level) makes it difficult to determine whether they are sustainable despite the great expectations of local residents.

The key factors for sustainability of the APs lie in the awareness-raising and organizational components. The elimination of child labor requires greater commitment and responsibility on the part of the mining communities, reflected in their participation and the monitoring of child labor in their respective localities. Women are more willing than men to take these steps, and this is an area that must be analyzed, because when projects are taken on with gender equity, they are strengthened and become sustainable.

Children and adolescents must not be excluded from playing a leading role in defending their own rights and leading movements that foster their development. New opportunities that complement schools and fill gaps for making good use of free time (such as recreational facilities) can be defended and promoted by the children and their families.

The sustainability of environmental improvements depends not only on material changes, but also on developing habits of caring for the environment, which is a longer-term process.

It is necessary that the APs' proposals become established at the institutional level, going beyond their teams, so that the community fabric being developed takes ownership of the proposal in an organic manner, including it in organizational plans, and so that local authorities include it in Development Plans. To achieve this, it is necessary to insist that governments comply with and/or pass legislation to implement international conventions (ILO 138 and 182). This also requires public pressure from civil society and community organizations.

Finally, a common element of the APs was the mobilization of parallel resources. This serves as an example for future sustainability of the results and the elimination of child labor (GAMA/COSUDE, ISAT, FONCODES, MINSA, MED, etc). In several cases, this was done through local committees or organizations. In this sense, the strategy of support, negotiation and shared responsibility for actions among groups and institutions is viable and has amplified the effects of the interventions.

### **3.5. Efficiency in Carrying out Activities**

There was some delay in the surveys and local studies, which explains delays in carrying out certain activities. The activities most affected were those in the technological modernization component, while greater levels of efficiency were found in those related to

---

<sup>28</sup> In extremely poor communities, the sustainability of basic services is always an unresolved issue because of the limited resources for maintaining and replacing them. Who will assume this task and how are questions that must be asked realistically for service-related components (how does a viable Local Development Plan view these in the short and medium term?).

**awareness raising, health and education.** This explains the effects achieved in most zones during the second year, because the first year was mainly devoted to studies and coordination.

The **production component** suffered an initial impasse because of the lack of prior studies that would have made possible the rapid design of proposals and their immediate implementation. In Santa Filomena, legalization and formalization of the plant was the main challenge to timely implementation of activities related to this objective and the main reason for setbacks in the planned timeline.

In other localities, this objective was eliminated or significantly changed. In Llalagua, CEPROMIN replaced the mill for crushing tin ore with a soldering workshop because of the current low profit margin for tin. In Ecuador, meanwhile, the directors of the mining organization did not agree with the idea of installing a cyanide plant, because it would compete with economic interests of members of the mining societies.

In Tipuani, MEDMIN met the goals for planned activities despite a delay in disbursement of funds that forced it to cover the shortfall with its own funds. A metallurgical mining study was done to determine the possibilities for technological innovation. Based on the results, tools were provided to 225 families. Training in environmental issues and industrial safety and ongoing technical assistance and oversight were also provided. It should be noted that the decision to work with the *Fundación MEDMIN* was good because it has experience in the Program's areas of action. In Potosí, so far, CDR is not carrying out activities related to technological improvement.

With regard to **revolving funds**, in Santa Filomena there is a high level of compliance with planned targets in areas related to training and support for small businesses. While the establishment of a fund managed by the businesswomen themselves is in an intermediate phase, however, the organization that will take charge of it remains to be established.

In Mollehuaca, the change of implementing agency in each phase (three altogether) created difficulties for the continuity of the work because each new implementing agency had to develop the necessary level of trust and legitimacy. When CESIP began working, it noticed that not all estimates were accurate: the number of beneficiaries was inflated, the estimated increase in agricultural land was greater than the number of hectares actually available, the number of lots occupied was lower than the estimate. These errors forced a readjustment of results and/or a decrease in beneficiaries, creating a certain level of irritation among local residents. Finally, various levels of special expertise were needed (agriculture, environmental sanitation, microenterprises, legal advice, mining legislation, etc). CESIP only had experience in fewer than half the action areas involved, so it contracted experts for most components. Despite these difficulties, it attained a relatively high completion rate for the work plans and activities to which it had committed, especially as of the second quarter.

In Bolivia, the emphasis of the program carried out by CEPROMIN was on integral and technical training for women, but the desired level of interconnection with other strategies was not achieved. The number of loans granted is far below the planned amount: only five small loans of \$250 (2.5% of the total amount). It should be noted that the person responsible for implementation of the entire program is also in charge of granting the loans. This system fosters a high degree of paternalism. Because they are in-kind loans, it also means that the coordinator loses time purchasing raw materials and supplies. In the case of CDR, there was moderate achievement of the objectives of training for women in knitting and handcrafts; the part involving marketing is still pending. Training in various technical areas was also provided for 100 adolescents who work in mining.

In Tipuani, MEDMIN achieved an intermediate rate of completion of activities planned in the area of microenterprises. The Local Committees have organized themselves in subcommittees for each planned activity and have their own rules and norms of operation. A technical assistance agreement was established with the Catholic University of Bolivia for the pig-raising project, and the first harvest from fish farming has been sold, with the income being reinvested to expand the project. In the agricultural area, the project experimented with the cultivation of vegetables and legumes, but they did not survive because of a blight known locally as “*tuju*.”

In Ecuador, workshops were established for goldsmithing and the raising of small animals. When the project began, some families complained because their children were not included and criticized the project for being exclusive (benefiting those who worked in the mines). This situation was resolved with an agreement to organize more workshops with support from the cooperative and interested individuals. Because of the delay in implementation of the AP, projects are still being designed for the installation of sewing and metalworking workshops. The leadership role of the Bella Rica Cooperative in carrying out the AP deserves special mention, even though the change of authorities and infighting between February and April 2002 interrupted the implementation of some activities. Its effectiveness as a partner was demonstrated with the signing of an agreement with DyA and in the resources it has contributed for construction of the goldsmithing workshop.

The second component that shows a lesser degree of efficiency is the *organizational* component, which is affected by complexities similar to those affecting the economic-productive component (cultural, conflicts, etc) and requires staff, perhaps local promoters, dedicated just to this area.

In Santa Filomena, the main outputs and results were ready at the end of the AP, so they did not influence the carrying out of the project. In this sense, adequate support was not given to strengthening the Management Committee of Santa Filomena to counterbalance the weight of the SOTRAMI mining association in the life of the community. Despite these delays, one significant result was the formation of the Association of Small-Scale Traditional Miners of the South-Central Region and the two conferences held by this organization. There was also a certain conflict between the “project’s time” and the “community’s time,” due to such factors as levels of awareness, community priorities or the tendency of local organizations to make decisions in assemblies, which slows down the decision-making process. Given this situation, strategic planning activities were held, annual operating plans designed and agreements signed defining the specific responsibilities of each party, the type of collaboration involved and the timeline.

In Mollehuaca, despite the short time involved and the weakness of institutions, the Community Development Council (*Consejo Comunal de Desarrollo*, CODEMO) is considered responsible for the project’s sustainability. In this sense, the AP did not have a sufficiently solid community representative to serve as an effective partner in multiplying, replicating or disseminating information about the project’s action areas.

In La Rinconada, because of the community’s lack of trust, the team opted for a prudent strategy of establishing personal relationships and living with the poorest and most marginalized residents, contractors, teachers, local authorities and leaders. One important aspect of this strategy was the formation of the implementing team, which understood regional idiosyncrasies and had experience in social and organizational work; the team was very small, however, with only one person present almost full time and two providing frequent support either in the field or from the headquarters in Puno.

With regard to the Bolivia AP, the awareness-raising strategies planned by CEPROMIN are being carried out within the allocated budget and with the expected quality and results.

Nevertheless, there are outputs and activities in which efficiency has not been achieved. Although the goal of preparing posters, stickers and informational radio spots was met, the preparation of monthly informational bulletins was eliminated. Instead, simple leaflets about the mining process were prepared. Sudden changes in planned activities weakened the consistency of the instruments used and the information distributed. It should be noted that on the initiative of the CEPROMIIN AP and with support from the Ombudsman's Office for Children, the groundwork has been laid for the formation of an Interinstitutional Commission.

In Tipuani, MEDMIN held a workshop with the goal of forming an Interinstitutional Committee that would include organizations from the communities of Chima and Chuquini. The lack of time and resources and parallel work with two communities that had different dynamics forced the speeding up of processes. This has reduced the possibility of providing greater attention to the Committees and their joint work with other institutions.

In Potosí, CDR has partially completed the production of informational materials and radio programs. The preparation of statutes and action plans for the network is still pending. It should be noted that there have been delays in the actions that have been implemented, and follow-up and evaluation have only been done in some cases.

In Bella Rica, Ecuador, DyA has efficiently supported organizational processes that were unprecedented in the zone: the youth organization, goldsmiths' organization, Local Management Committee and Parents' Committee. At first, the program had planned to provide technical assistance for the formulation of products and development of negotiation skills. In practice, however, this turned out not to be relevant, because it assumed that the cooperative was a beneficiary and not a partner, as established in the AP.

In conclusion, the economic-productive and organizational components have demonstrated greater difficulties, perhaps because the time and human and material resources needed to implement them were underestimated. These two components are more demanding than those involving awareness-raising actions and services such as education and health. Development economic and income-generation proposals also implies analyzing access to markets, which was not done. In this sense, the levels of efficiency were subject to the internal capacities of the implementing agencies and to extremely complex external conditions that were not sufficiently analyzed at the start.

## **3.6. Program Organization and Management**

### **3.6.1. Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation**

Both the overall Project and the APs have an integral design that includes various components and goals that were very high in comparison to what could feasibly be achieved in the short term as part of the first phase of the USDOL-funded IPEC Program.

One difficulty related to *planning* was that there were no previous national and local studies. These had to be done at the beginning, reducing the time available for direct action and delaying the start of the project. After the startup period, the studies began in the third or fourth month and ended in approximately the seventh or eighth month of the first year. The national studies are integral surveys that do not constitute a base line that would make it possible to measure indicators of objectively verifiable results. These studies were more useful in raising awareness among public officials and National Commissions on the Elimination of Child Labor.

The national surveys were going to be complemented with local base lines in order to examine in greater depth the main variables and the economic feasibility of the actions proposed by certain APs (e.g., Bella Rica, Mollehuaca, Llallagua, Tipuani). Some local studies are deficient, however, in such areas as the analysis of marketing possibilities for the small businesses established as part of the program.

The *planning and scheduling of activities* has been done quarterly in consensus with the community. Quarterly evaluations have also been done, facilitating close monitoring of the implementation. There have been some delays in activities because of the delay in the results from awareness-raising actions and because of the slowness of the processes of community participation being developed. For this reason, some actions began in the third quarter of the Program.

For *monitoring* of activities, there was a lack of sufficiently detailed **Annual Operating Plans** and internal monitoring systems that would have enabled the implementers to compare the inputs used with activities planned and make timely adjustments.<sup>29</sup>

It is important to note that a first *evaluation* of the Program was done at the end of the first year, carried out internally with the participation of the implementing agencies. This participatory planning and evaluation is one of the principal strengths of the regional IPEC Mining team, which has a small professional staff considering the many actions that it must monitor and carry out (directing campaigns and motivating national networks).

### 3.6.2. Implementing Teams

While the Program was under way, there were changes in the implementing teams in Ecuador and Peru, which led to delays in activities. These included:

- In Ecuador, activities were begun by the government agency INNFA (two mini-projects, one in education and one in health), which had also designed the AP. IPEC Mining later decided jointly that the AP should be implemented by the NGO *Desarrollo y Autogestión* (DyA), which readjusted the proposal during the first quarter because it had been formulated in generic terms and without feasibility studies. This revision was relevant but affected the implementation timeline.
- There were also institutional changes in Mollehuaca (Peru), where the decision was made for this phase to be implemented by CESIP. This was a transfer phase, because the work in this community had begun five years earlier with support from AECI. As a result, this was an extremely complex challenge for CESIP, because it was assumed that the objectives of the previous phases had been achieved.

Another difficulty is the small size of the implementing teams. While in Ecuador it was expanded to seven people (including four local promoters, expert consultants and the support of the institution's management personnel), in La Rinconada (Peru) the opposite was true: the staff decreased because some could not adapt to the rigors of the altitude (5,200 meters above sea level) and the extremely low temperatures. A key factor in the good implementation of the AP, however, is that the RED TITIKAKA implementing team was coordinated by a priest from the Department of Puno who won the miners' trust. The other teams were also very small for the number of actions included in the APs.

---

<sup>29</sup> An exception would be the National Coordinating Office in Bolivia, where there were three large timelines (GANTT charts) on the wall with the activities corresponding to each of the three APs.

The working conditions were harsh and the pay was low, which made it difficult to hire more specialized personnel and led to turnover, as in the case of Ecuador.

The inclusion of local promoters in some implementing teams has been a valuable strategy (e.g., Bella Rica, Tipuani, Mollehuaca). Local promoters become long-term allies in places that are distant and difficult to reach. They are also closer to the local people (and if they have finished secondary school and have gone on to post-secondary studies, their contribution is qualitatively greater). Local promoters who have been properly selected take a great interest in the community and have initiative, a vocation of service and leadership skills.

According to the implementing agencies interviewed and IPEC Mining's National Coordinating Offices in each country, technical and administrative guidance while the APs were being implemented and carried out was adequate. There was smooth communication as well as consensus-based responses regarding the administration and particular characteristics of each Program. A central point of which IPEC should take note, however, was that most of the implementing agencies do not specialize in small-scale traditional mining and the elimination of child labor in this activity. In that sense, the ONGs demonstrated an initial weakness given the complexity of the APs.

### 3.6.3. Budget Management

The approved budget underwent modifications, mainly a sharp decrease in investment in equipment and miscellaneous expenses, but this made it possible to increase investment in training.

Expenses for Program personnel, missions, studies and consultants amounted to 30.89% of the total budget, while the APs (seven zones), campaigns and seminars represent barely 52.53%, a proportionally small amount. The difference (16.58%) corresponds to miscellaneous expenses and ILO/IPEC overhead.

#### Budget summary, 2000 – 2002

	BUDGET LINE ITEMS	PLANNED 20/11/00	READJUSTED 04/11/02	Variat. %
10	PROJECT PERSONNEL, MISSIONS, EVALUATIONS, CONSULTANTS (NATIONAL STUDIES, SIMOV)	799,350	878,716	9.0
20	SUBCONTRACTS (7 APs, MINIPROGRAMS, CAMPAIGNS )	1,333,000	1,392,047	4.2
30	TRAINING (SEMINARS)	63,000	102,434	38.5
40	EQUIPMENT	100,000	63,189	-58.3
50	MISCELLANEOUS EXPENSES	122,305	93,810	-30.4
60	SUPPORT PROGRAM (13%)	328,926	314,296	-4.7
70	PROVISION FOR COST INCREASES	127,172	0	0.0
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>2,873,753</b>	<b>2,844,492</b>	<b>-1.0</b>

The line item representing the greatest expense in the APs is the income-generation component; in the future it will be necessary to evaluate whether the distribution among the components was the most appropriate and whether it would be more sustainable to invest

more in awareness raising, changing attitudes and support for the strengthening of organizations and less in small businesses in those areas where no market exists.

Technological changes that have a direct influence on the elimination of child labor are extremely relevant, but it has been noted that several of the planned outputs could not be achieved. This means that the study and analysis of those involved must be refined before proposals for the next phase are designed.

The inputs originally planned for some APs were modified in consensus with IPEC Mining. In Ecuador, changes were made in the design of certain activities because DyA placed greater emphasis on the education component and eliminated handout-type inputs (such as scholarships), replacing them with extracurricular and vacation educational activities and teacher training.

In Peru, investment has continued in activities whose sustainability cannot be achieved in one year in a phase that was meant to transfer what had already been accomplished. In Mollehuaca the objective of supporting income-generating units required the greatest budget allocations but did not produce the expected results. In the four production units (knitting, sewing, goldsmithing and the bakery), about US\$9,300 was invested for a group of 64 workshop participants who were trained, although no more than 24 were really active. That represents an investment of nearly US\$150 per person trained or US\$400 per active participant.

It should be noted, however, that funds were leveraged in this zone for organizational support. Expenses for the objective of support for organizations, especially CODEMO, were mainly related to training and guidance. GAMA added 30,000 nuevos soles for this. In general, the benefit from this investment has been considerable, because training has been provided for a significant number of leaders, some of whom have led implementing groups that have succeeded in leveraging resources worth more than 400,000 nuevos soles (from FONCODES, GAMA and other donors). This expense also facilitated the process of legal land titling in Mollehuaca and recent efforts at establishing mining claims. Similar success, however, was not seen in two activities that were particularly important for the AP: the formation of the oversight commission and negotiation with the mining company.

In Santa Filomena, 82% of the budget was allocated for construction of the mini-plant for processing ore and the revolving funds, that is, to tangible or monetary goods that would remain in the community and for which it was essential to generate the capacities and conditions necessary for sustainability. These represent expenses for infrastructure that is essential when working with sectors where there is a serious lack of equipment, because it has a direct impact on living conditions and generates support for the AP's proposal. The rest were less tangible expenses, such as training, studies, workshops and conferences, as well as personnel and operating costs, amounting to 16% of the total, well below the percentage common in other promotional projects.

Effective implementation of the project was possible thanks to the team's capacity for leveraging community, government and international cooperation resources. Complementary support amounting to US\$117,100 was obtained, in which support from the GAMA program carried special weight. It was obtained before the AP began, making it possible to design the plant, carry out the environmental impact study and design the tailings pond, elements that cost more than US\$40,000. The World Bank contributed US\$5,000 for the plant's environmental plan. In terms of community resources, SOTRAMI

contributed US\$20,000 for the formalization and construction of the plant and assumed, in the form of a loan, half the cost of construction.<sup>30</sup>

In La Rinconada, very few of the activities could have been postponed or eliminated, and only with sufficient justification. Most travel has been by public transportation and amounts allocated for travel expenses have been minimal and could even be considered unfair to the team.

In Bolivia, resources for the CEPROMIN AP were sufficient and there were two disbursements, the first, US\$20,000, in early July, and the second, US\$76,000, in December. Even though the second disbursement was delayed, the AP was not affected.

There was a delay in implementation of the Potosí AP, which revealed indications of poor financial management by CDR and affected the relationship with CDR's former administrator and then-director. This led to a change in administration. Added to this was a delay in the payback of loans, which set back such activities as the signing of interinstitutional agreements and subcontracts with consultants for various actions.

So far, there has been no spending on business training, technological management or industrial safety. About 4% of the budget was spent on equipment for microenterprises, and in the third quarter the entire amount budgeted for technological changes was spent with no reports yet submitted about how it was used. The funds allocated for radio programs were spent in the third quarter, with a balance to date of 80% of the total amount budgeted. Funds budgeted for informational materials were spent in the fourth quarter, amounting to 88% of the total amount budgeted.

In conclusion, there were delays in carrying out activities, with a resulting delay in spending. There were also changes in budget line items, mainly in the area of technological changes, which were postponed or eliminated, with an increase in investment in training. It should also be noted that the implementing teams were very small for the breadth of the task and for the multidisciplinary nature and prior experience required by the APs.

---

<sup>30</sup> IPEC's support to the plant in Santa Filomena was provided in the form of a donation of equipment and the provision of technical assistance for a total value of US\$150,000). The plant also received support from other donors: US\$117,000 in complementary donations from the World Bank (US\$5,000), the GAMA Project, a bilateral Project of the Ministry of Energy and Mines of Peru and the Swiss Cooperation Agency for Development, COSUDE (US\$40,000); and a contribution from the Society of Mine Workers of Santa Filomena, SOTRAMI (US\$20,000). SOTRAMI also pledged to return 50% of the amount donated by the IPEC Project (US\$75,000) and contribute this amount to Santa Filomena's Revolving Fund so that it can be reinvested in other projects in the community.

## 4. Conclusions and Recommendations

### 4.1. General Conclusion

The Program set great challenges for itself and has achieved its main short-term goals. It set out to address an issue under very complex social, cultural and political conditions with some implementing teams that had little experience in the area.

The intervention has been shown to be valid and relevant in contexts of high poverty and social exclusion, such as small-scale traditional mining communities. The initial invisibility of the working conditions of children in small-scale traditional mining was a characteristic common to Ecuador, Peru and Bolivia, and IPEC Mining has succeeded, in some countries more than others, in exposing the problem and the urgent need to eliminate it.

The three countries in which the intervention has taken place, whether because of elements related to government policy or the characteristics of the implementing teams, have demonstrated different levels of progress and results.

In Ecuador, great progress has been made at the national level, and the government has taken ownership of the IPEC/ILO proposal in coordination with other cooperation agencies such as UNICEF. In Ecuador and Peru, a commitment is being obtained from the government to monitor the elimination of child labor in mining. In Bolivia, the government's inertia and passivity toward children's issues, reinforced by "handout-type" investments from international cooperation agencies, make it necessary to revise intervention strategies and be more demanding about commitments that must be assumed by the central government and local governments as a condition for receiving aid (this is also valid for Peru). All projects must help strengthen democratic institutions, which is somewhat fragile in the region's countries. The overall view is that in all three countries, a collective strategy of citizen participation and oversight of children's problems and rights must be firmly established.

In most cases, the Direct Action Programs (APs) have achieved a good level of completion of activities and strategies for a first phase. Developing intervention models, however, will require an ongoing process of reflection and critical analysis leading from practice to theory on the basis of the results obtained.

Each implementing team has experienced both achievements and difficulties in program management, but all have demonstrated seriousness and a high level of responsibility in their assigned tasks despite the health risks to which they have been exposed in places that are especially harsh.

### 4.2. Specific Conclusions

1. The national surveys were very broad and need to be complemented with local studies and economic feasibility studies. These should end with the establishment of a base line. The National Studies could have been better used for revising and adjusting the proposal.
2. Although all activities and results have been oriented toward the development objective of eliminating child labor, the APs should have better designed the specific indicators

- for measuring this objective, the sources of verification, assumptions and annual operating plans.
3. The lack of analysis of external factors and unforeseen impacts had to be addressed once the project was under way, reducing effectiveness.
  4. The lack of a more refined analysis of stakeholders limited the design of roles and functions that each group or entity in the community would have to assume. This analysis, accompanied by a more participatory formulation of intervention strategies, would have better ensured the beneficiaries' commitment, making the possibilities for social sustainability in the short or medium term more viable from the start.
  5. The lack of base lines for each AP made it impossible to do an evaluation comparing progress with initial situations. In most cases, the individual evaluations of the APs have compared the activities planned to those carried out (when the plan was not inferred from a base line). In cases in which there was no operating plan, it has only been possible to compare final results against themselves or with the group of participants.
  6. Having an integrated, *ad hoc* monitoring and evaluation system for the Program would have made possible timely decisions and simultaneous, shared oversight of the seven communities (through a computerized, networked EMP system). The quarterly reports filled this gap to a large extent, but not completely.
  7. The APs made significant achievements in awareness raising. One of the most rapid and tangible was the mining cooperatives' prohibition against adolescents working in the mines. This is an example that could become a model if accompanied by age-appropriate opportunities for making good use of the free time. The cost/opportunity issue is key.
  8. The education component has been fundamental to the strategy, as demonstrated by the results in school re-enrollment in all the intervention zones. More attention must be paid to secondary school enrollment, however, because adolescents dedicate more hours to mining tasks, including work inside the mines. For this reason, the educational system's attractiveness and responsiveness to their needs and expectations are vital factors.
  9. Investment in improvements in educational infrastructure and materials has been effective as a variable for attraction, but care must be taken that the immediate impact does not get lost over time. It must be accompanied by pedagogical changes and changes in the attitudes of teachers and parents. Group dynamics and conflict resolution should be included, because schools operating under adverse conditions with little government attention have internal problems.
  10. The health component was highly relevant and had positive results in the beneficiaries' access to services. These are not differentiated according to the APs' goals; rather, care is provided for the general community (this is even truer because the transfer is to the local Health Center). *Health education* and *public health* actions could be reinforced based on the problems of children and their families in small-scale traditional mining communities.
  11. The economic-productive and technological component presented a series of difficulties that merit a reformulation, taking as the point of departure a feasibility analysis of the small businesses or production activities because the local market could

rapidly become saturated. It should also be remembered that imports place small-scale national production at a disadvantage and make it difficult to compete.

12. The organizational component is more complex than the other four and requires knowledge of lobbying and local political advocacy. It would be important to address this from a gender equity perspective.

An analysis of the efficiency of the activities shows that there have been delays in various places. The first year has been dedicated to studies, coordination and the awareness-raising component. Progress was also made in health and education. The greatest setbacks were in the economic-productive component, partly because technological changes require reaching consensus with mining associations and developing the corresponding designs, and partly because revolving funds require consultation and bidding processes.

13. The implementing teams are very small for the program's scope and work under difficult conditions, traveling and living several days a week in the mining communities. Mechanisms and incentives such as training and internships should be considered to ensure that they remain with the team.
14. When activities were postponed or certain technological investments were eliminated, budget line items were modified to provide more funds for training, which was a good decision.

### **4.3. Recommendations for a Second Phase**

#### **Design**

- 1 Develop a uniform design for the APs that are in a second phase, systematically documenting and sharing the perspectives and concepts underlying the IPEC Mining proposal. The intervention criteria and certain strategies should be uniform. Differences between larger, more developed areas and mining communities that are far from cities and markets must also be taken into account.
- 2 The APs have produced a battery of indicators for IPEC Mining that should be systematically documented. When they are applied, however, we recommend selecting a minimal set of key indicators and making a comparative analysis among indicators of results (e.g., technological improvement — increase in income — elimination of child labor).
- 3 Update strategies, including contributions from the National and Local Studies and distinguish between gold mining and tin and zinc mining (Llallagua and Potosí).
- 4 Develop a base line for a sample of families in each zone, based on indicators from the program's logical framework, differentiating by sex and age group.
- 5 Revise and update the analysis of the participation of local and national stakeholders and external factors. This must be done with participatory methodologies involving the stakeholders themselves, in separate groups, to determine their current view of the problem, their interest in solving it, the sustainable strategy that could be applied and the parties with whom conflicts exist (forces contrary to the proposal).
- 6 With regard to each component:
  - In the education component, it is necessary to review proposals for rural education in Latin America, which would be more appropriate for the APs because of their location and the characteristics of the populations with which they work. One proposal that could be useful is that of the FAO, which links basic education, training for rural work, microenterprises for subsistence and better nutrition in schools. It is also important to establish commitments with schools and parents so

they propose and take ownership of strategies related to the use of the children's free time and give them a leading role in establishing such actions (e.g., libraries, recreational facilities, vacation camps, technical training, cultural and recreational activities, etc.). The quality of education must be seen as a community task and responsibility that also involves the local government.

- For the health component, the Primary Care Model should be complemented with an intervention in the area of Public Health, with key, systematic strategies of Education for Health. Because human resources are limited, the strategy of community health promoters could be a good alternative.
- For the organizational component, an updated analysis is needed of the community's fabric and the complexity of its organizations. Strategies must be defined at three levels: the individual level, identifying and establishing natural leaders; organizations and their internal management; and the level of society, to build capacity for establishing synergies and negotiating with governmental or private stakeholders to achieve the Program's objectives and those of the communities. The gender equity dimension is key in this component.
- The economic-productive component must differentiate among the environments of each zone and specific feasibility and market studies are needed to substantiate the profitability of the business or proposed income-generating activity in local and regional markets. To reinforce its implementation, this component could be carried out in conjunction with other institutions with expertise in this area, particularly in the case of revolving funds, which should have specialized guidance.

7 With regard to IPEC's organization and management:

- Reinforce the use of participatory methodologies in the formulation of strategies and local monitoring; this anchors the proposal more firmly in the community and reinforces sustainability.

Apply shared management strategies to a greater degree in all components so community members lead and take ownership of the actions, acquiring management capacities and skills that the implementing teams should transfer. Increase local leadership.

- Ensure that every component of the proposal is established at the institutional level, not leaving them to be supported by the program's resources except at the beginning. Afterward there should be motivation to mobilize local and governmental resources to ensure sustainability.
- Give the direct beneficiaries — the children and adolescents — a greater role. Their capacity to analyze the problem and lead specific actions should be strengthened to reinforce their self-esteem, community participation and ability to defend their own rights.
- Design strategies, an organizational model and mechanisms for local citizen oversight of child labor in the intervention zones to prevent or warn of possible increases in the problem in order to address them.

8 Carry out a participatory evaluation of the National Commissions and redefine roles and commitments. In Ecuador, the emphasis could be on more firmly establishing the commission, while in Peru and Bolivia an in-depth critical analysis is needed of external factors and internal objectives that can be addressed so the commissions can

be re-established. To ensure the commitment of national resources, it is important that cooperation agencies participating in these commissions do not lead them.

- 9 IPEC Mining must reinforce the signatory governments' compliance with the international conventions on child labor.

### **Suggestions for replication**

Based on the evaluation, a preliminary exercise in drawing up guidelines for projects of this magnitude indicates that the following should be taken into account:

1. Besides startup time for the Project and for establishing national offices, preliminary time must be allotted within the Project timeline for studies for each country and each AP. This time, which should be at least one semester, would include national studies, analysis of stakeholders and definition of a base line and profiles. These can serve as the basis for readjusting the overall formulation of the AP with the participation of the implementing teams and beneficiary groups. This means that the implementing agencies must already be chosen.
2. Hold meetings at the beginning and afterward, working systematically with the implementing teams to develop uniform criteria and concepts; share experiences, methodologies and strategies; and jointly evaluate, from a regional perspective, the results of the monitoring and evaluation of the program, which should be part of a networked computer system.
3. The Direct Action Programs should clearly define final situations broken down by year, the level of processes and outputs for an implementation period of approximately three years.
  - a. In the first year: the AP must become inserted and anchored in the community with the startup of activities related to awareness raising, the improvement of services and the groundwork for the development of strategic organizations. This can include cultural and extracurricular activities. The first year must involve awareness raising and specific results in owners of mining claims in each zone. The next stage should not begin until this one is completed satisfactorily (a monitoring system is needed for this reason).
  - b. Second year: must be a time of organizational development and the beginning of the transfer of results or outputs. This could include some microenterprises as long as feasibility studies have been done.
  - c. Third year: must be the start of the implementing agency's withdrawal, with project management assumed by local organizations in coordination with local governments and state agencies.

Three-year time periods are probably too short in some cases, depending on the size of the population and the complexity of the problem. A key difference is whether the project involves areas with a large population (such as La Rinconada, Potosí and Llallagua) or small mining communities (such as Santa Filomena, Mollehuaca, Tipuani and Bella Rica).

4. One key factor is finding local implementing teams of at least five people, besides the coordinator, who have expertise in the components to be implemented, including:
  - a. A focus on the elimination of child labor in mining;
  - b. Experience in the participatory formulation and management of projects;
  - c. Ability to manage projects related to child labor with gender and environmental dimensions;
  - d. Experience in community organizational development and establishing linkages among stakeholders;
  - e. Ability to lobby and formulate policy;
  - f. Experience in projects involving basic services (education, health, etc.);
  - g. Experience in microenterprises (this component could be carried out in association with other organizations that have expertise).

The latter two points could overlap; that is, if education or health have been completed and transferred, those experts could leave the team and others could be contracted for the economic and technological component.